

Session 188: Equity Market Returns: Reshaping the Risk Distribution

SOA Antitrust Compliance Guidelines SOA Presentation Disclaimer

Risk Reduction with Low Volatility Equity Portfolios



Laurie-Anne Davison, CFA, CAIA Vice President & Director, TD Asset Management

October 2019





Agenda

- Fundamentals of Low Volatility Investing
- Low Volatility and Currency Risk
- Low Volatility and Interest Rate Risk







Fundamentals of Low Volatility Investing







Source: TDAM, Bloomberg Finance L.P. Data as of February 2019





How Does this Affect the Factor Story?

Top quintile factor performance from 1963 to 2018







Return Asymmetry Tells Part of the Story

Factor upside and downside captures









Investment Theme

Exploiting a long-standing, often overlooked investment anomaly

- Low volatility stocks can generate strong risk-adjusted returns
- At equal risk, lower volatility (Q1) generate more than four times as much return as high volatility stocks (Q5)



MSCI World Total Return (CAD) from 1997/05 to 2018/09. Volatility quintile portfolios are rebalanced monthly.





MSCI ACWI vs. MSCI ACWI Minimum Volatility Index



¹MSCI ACWI-ND. ² FTSE 3-Month T-Bill.

Universe: eVestment Global Large Cap Equity. Source: eVestment Alliance. Results displayed in USD. For illustrative purposes only.





Have Historical Low Volatility Returns Been Outsized?



Source: MSCI Inc. As of March 31, 2019. All returns on the MSCI All Country World Indices in US dollars.





Adaptability Is a Choice



Basic statistical model Adaptive to factor changes Prone to spurious structure

Ideal model Adaptive to factor changes Persistent signals

Lagging structure

Basic fundamental model

Slow to adapt to factor changes Historically proven signals

Noisy Signal

Persistent Signal

SOCIETY OF ACTUARIES

For illustrative purposes only.





Low Volatility and Currency Risk





Is Currency Exposure a Diversifier or Unrewarded Risk?

How selected currencies behaved in falling equity markets

| Currency Return (vs USD) MSCI World USD | NZD | AUD | CAD | EUR | GBP | CHF | USD | JPY |
|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|------|------|
| | -2.6% | -2.6% | -1.8% | -1.1% | -0.8% | -0.6% | 0.0% | 0.4% |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Currency Return (vs CAD) MSCI World CAD | NZD | AUD | CAD | EUR | GBP | USD | CHF | JPY |
| | -1.1% | -1.1% | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.0% | 0.5% | 0.6% | 1.3% |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Currency Return (vs GBP) MSCI World GBP | AUD | NZD | CAD | EUR | USD | GBP | CHF | JPY |
| | -2.0% | -1.7% | -1.6% | -0.5% | -0.2% | 0.0% | 0.1% | 0.5% |

Source: MSCI Inc., TDAM. Average monthly data from January 2000 to June 2019. Note: For illustration only.





Additional Considerations in Currency Hedging

- Empirical role of currency (cyclical, counter-cyclical, or neutral)
 - Has this currency historically increased or decreased in value during market corrections?
- Impact on diversification
 - Would we hold more or less in the market if we hedged (i.e. does hedging increase or decrease risk according to risk model)?
- Currency volatility
 - How does currency volatility compare to equity volatility?





Currency Hedging: Both Time and Currency Specific





Source: MSCI, Bloomberg Finance L.P., TDAM. As of March 31, 2019.





Equity Portfolio Construction Conditional on Currency Hedging







Equity Portfolio Construction Conditional on Currency Hedging

100% 98% 96% 94% 92% 90% 88% 86% 84% Unhedged opt - Unhedged FX Unhedged opt - Hedged FX Hedged opt - Hedged FX

Expected volatility for different hedging policies

Source: TDAM. For illustrative purposes only.





More Meaningful Risk Reduction with Adjusted Risk Model

36-Month Moving Standard Deviation (Simulated Volatilities for U.S. Strategy)



Source: MSCI, TDAM.

Simulated low volatility portfolios are based on the MSCI ACWI stocks universe. They are built by using TDAM's proprietary risk models and are rebalanced monthly. The standard deviation is computed over a sliding 36-months window of simulated gross monthly returns in USD net of transaction costs. Simulated performance is unverified, and is developed with the benefit of hindsight and has inherent limitations. It is NOT an indicator of future actual results. Methodology is available upon request.







Low Volatility and Interest Rate Risk





2018: A Complex Volatility Story



¹ Jerome Powell Chairman of the Federal Reserve. Source: TDAM., Bloomberg Finance L.P. Data to July 31, 2019.





Market Direction Isn't the Whole Story

Time-varying correlation between market and rates



Source: TDAM., Bloomberg Finance L.P. As of December 31, 2018. Correlations are annual correlations between S&P500 Price Index returns and 10 year Treasury yield changes





How do Factors Perform During Market Shocks?







Factor Diversification for Inflation Defense?









Interest Rates: the Long-Term View



Source: CRSP (prior to 1979), Federal Reserve Economic Data (FRED), Standard & Poor's, TDAM. Data as of June 30, 2019.





Low Volatility Portfolios Have Shown Better Diversification



Source: FactSet. Data from March 29, 2013 to June 30, 2019. CW: Capitalization-weighted. MV: Minimum Volatility.





Investing in Low Volatility Equities Key considerations

Tailored Equity Risk Forecasting Models



Systematic Risk Framework



For illustrative purposes only.





Disclosures

The information contained herein has been provided by TD Asset Management Inc. and is for information purposes only. The information has been drawn from sources believed to be reliable. Graphs and charts are used for illustrative purposes only and do not reflect future values or future performance of any investment. The information does not provide financial, legal, tax or investment advice. Particular investment, tax, or trading strategies should be evaluated relative to each individual's objectives and risk tolerance.

The hypothetical performance information is shown for illustration purposes only and is not based on actual results, which may vary. Hypothetical performance information is subject to inherent risks and limitations, and is shown gross of fees and is calculated in U.S. dollars. No representations are being made that any proposal will achieve returns similar to the hypothetical information shown. Investors should not take this example or the data included as an indication, assurance, estimate or forecast of future or actual results. The actual performance returns may differ materially from the information shown for reasons including, but not limited to investment restrictions and guidelines, fees, timing of trade execution, investment/reinvestment of cash flows, treatment of dividends, interest fees charged including performance fees, portfolio rebalancing, borrowing fees on shorts, swap fees, the extent of leverage used, any use of derivatives, and fluctuations in the market.

Commissions, trailing commissions, management fees and expenses all may be associated with mutual fund investments. Please read the fund facts and prospectus, which contain detailed investment information, before investing. Mutual funds are not guaranteed or insured, their values change frequently and past performance may not be repeated. Mutual fund strategies and current holdings are subject to change.

Bloomberg and Bloomberg.com are trademarks and service marks of Bloomberg Finance L.P., a Delaware limited partnership, or its subsidiaries. All rights reserved.

TD Asset Management Inc. is a wholly-owned subsidiary of The Toronto-Dominion Bank.

All trademarks are the property of their respective owners.







Equity Market Return: Reshaping the Risk Distribution

Raghu Ramachandran

30 October 2019





Naïve factoring

S&P 500®

Value

Growth





Index Innovation Across Risk Management Strategies Risk Control: A framework for managing volatility







Index Innovation Across Risk Management Strategies Strategy Overview: A diverse set of strategies with a broad set of uses

| Category | Attributes | Example Index Strategy | | |
|--|---|---|--|--|
| Risk Control / Volatility Targeted Strategies | Seeks to reduce (increase) exposure to an index / portfolio based on its volatility | S&P 500 Low Volatility Daily Risk Control 5% Index | | |
| Tail Risk Managed | Strategies that allocate between equity, volatility, and cash | S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index | | |
| Managed Risk Strategies | Using a multi-asset risk control framework combined with portfolio protection | S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index | | |
| Defined / Target Outcome Strategies | Portfolio strategies which define payout characteristics at the end of a specified period of time | CBOE S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series | | |





Index Innovation Across Risk Management Strategies Strategy Overview: Different strategies can be captured across multiple wrappers

| Index Strategy | Index Overview | Product Wrappers |
|---|--|---|
| S&P 500 Low Volatility Daily Risk Control 5% Index | Portfolio consisting of the S&P 500 Low Volatility Index and cash with daily reallocation to achieve a 5% volatility target | Fixed Indexed Annuities Structured Products |
| S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index | Dynamically allocates long-only exposure between the S&P 500, the S&P VIX [®] Short-Term Futures Index | Fixed Indexed Annuities Structured Products |
| S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index | Volatility targeted portfolio with the S&P 500 and fixed income with a daily 22% volatility target. Capital protection allocation strategy. | ETFsVariable Annuities |
| CBOE S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series | Portfolios consisting of the S&P 500 and S&P 500 options which cap the upside participation in order to provide downside protection | ETFs Structured Notes Structured / Hybrid Annuities |





Risk Managed Indices

- Target Volatility Funds
- Managed Volatility Funds
- Tail Risk Funds
- Buffer Funds
- Balanced Funds





Target Volatility

Daily Volatility Risk Control 5% Daily Volatility Risk Control 10%



Volatility Target Weighting

Low Volatility Risk Control 5%







Equity – Cash Allocation

$$Equity \ Allocation = \min\left\{max \ leverage, \frac{Volatility \ Target}{Realized \ Historical \ Volatility}\right\}$$





Allocation to Equity





Performance






Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.





Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.





How the Managed Risk Overlay Works?



A VOLATIL

VOLATILITY MANAGEMENT

✓ Model:

Assume a risk control model supplying short- and long-term variance and covariance for the underlying equity and reserve asset indices

Test all combinations and seek to identify a portfolio of equity and reserve asset indices with a historic volatility equal to the target



Outputs: Equity and Reserve Asset Weights without hedge

 Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Chart is provided for illustrative purposes. *Please refer to index methodology available at http://us.spindices.com/documents/methodologies/methodology-sp-managed-risk-2-index-series.pdf?force_download=true_for more details.





How the Managed Risk Overlay Works?



CAPITAL PROTECTION STRATEGY

Model:

 \checkmark

Self-financing: To avoid borrowing funds, a portion of the underlying volatility managed index is sold to finance the put option position

Black Scholes theory: replicating the put option requires a short position in the underlying volatility managed index and a long position in the M-maturity zero coupon bond











How the Managed Risk Overlay Works?

COMBINE A AND B

- ✓ Combine volatility management with put option replication to determine the target asset weights, subject to a minimum exposure of 0% and a maximum exposure of 100% for each constituent.
- ✓ Efficient hedging: Protection comes with a cost. Although options on broad market indices are usually expensive, put option replication in the presence of volatility management tends to have lower and more stable performance costs.
- ✓ A hypothetical portfolio is illustrated on the right.
- ✓ **Outputs:** Final Equity and Reserve Asset Weights with hedge



Hypothetical Portfolio







Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.





S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR



S&P 500 VIX Short-Term Futures Allocation

| Realized Volatility | Implied Volatility Trend | | |
|---------------------|--------------------------|----------|----------|
| | Down Trend | No Trend | Up Trend |
| RV < 10% | 2.5% | 2.5% | 10.0% |
| 10% < RV < 20% | 2.5% | 10.0% | 15.0% |
| 20% < RV < 35% | 10.0% | 15.0% | 25.0% |
| 35% < RV < 45% | 15.0% | 25.0% | 40.0% |
| RV > 45% | 25.0% | 40.0% | 40.0% |





Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.







Source: CBOE, S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.







Source: CBOE, S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.





Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.





Balanced







Performance



Source: S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Index data as of March 29, 2019. Index performance based on USD Total or Excess Returns. Charts and graphs are provided for illustrative purposes. Past performance is not an indication or guarantee of future results. These charts and graphs may reflect hypothetical historical performance. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this document for more information regarding the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.







Reshaping the Risk Distribution of Traditional Risk Managed Funds

Naoya Kobayashi, M.Sc., FSA, CFA, CERA

October 30, 2019





Analysis of risk managed funds

Examined performance of S&P Indices that track various strategies







1 year investment in SPXT every day over historical period



#1: invest from 1990-01-02 to 1990-12-31
#2: invest from 1990-01-03 to 1991-01-02

:
:

#7179: invest from 2018-07-02 to 2019-06-28





1 year investment in SPXT every day over historical period







1 year investment in SPXT every day over historical period







Also look at 5 year investment horizons









Target volatility funds



S&P 500 Daily Risk Control 5% Index

•February 1990 – June 2019



S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index

•March 1990 – June 2019



Cboe S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series

•December 2005 – June 2019



S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index

•December 2005 – June 2019

SPXT

S&P 500 Total Return Index (SPXT)

• January 1990 – June 2019











1-year return volatility by investment date

- Limited downside exposure
- ✓ Smoothed volatility and returns













- **×** Hedge inefficient
- **×** Significant drag









Volatility is the wrong driver

Protection too little when needed / too much when not needed

Realized volatility = standard deviation is a trailing measure







Volatility is the wrong driver

Protection too little when needed / too much when not needed

- Realized volatility = standard deviation is a trailing measure
- No distinction between upside and downside volatility
- **×** Cannot participate in strong recovery







Volatility is the wrong driver

Protection too little when needed / too much when not needed

- Realized volatility = standard deviation is a trailing measure
- No distinction between upside and downside volatility
- **×** Cannot participate in strong recovery
- × Delayed signal
- Vulnerable to crash with no volatility warning







S&P indices incorporating potential strategy improvements







Improvement #1: Increase efficiency

S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index (SPXMR2)







Improvement #1: Increase efficiency

S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index (SPXMR2)

 Drag still significant









Improvement #1: Increase efficiency

S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index (SPXMR2)

- Moneyness of protection (moving average) is a trailing measure
- Cannot participate in strong recovery
- × Delayed signal
- Vulnerable to crash with no volatility warning







Improvement #2: Incorporate option payoff

Cboe S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series (SPRO)

- Significant reduction in drag
- ✓ Keeps upside potential









Improvement #2: Incorporate option payoff

Cboe S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series (SPRO)







Improvement #3: Incorporate VIX futures S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index (SPVQDTR)

- ✓ Beats SPXT on upside
- Significant reduction in drag
- Can protect against a sudden drop
- ✓ Implied volatility trend ⇒ forward looking









Improvement #3: Incorporate VIX futures S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index (SPVQDTR)

- ✓ Beats SPXT on upside
- Significant reduction in drag
- Can protect against a sudden drop
- ✓ Implied volatility trend ⇒ forward looking







Improvement #3: Incorporate VIX futures

S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index (SPVQDTR)

- Sometimes behavior very different from SPXT
- Sometimes minimal protection / drag in down market






Potential strategy improvements



S&P 500 Daily Risk Control 5% Index

• Smoothed volatility and returns

SPXMR2

S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index

• Efficient protection with put option replication

SPRO

Cboe S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series

 Buy / sell options to incorporate nonlinear payoff structure

SPVQDTR

S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index

• Forward-looking measures





Potential strategy improvements

Work in progress



S&P 500 Daily Risk Control 5% Index

Smoothed volatility and returns

SPXMR2

S&P 500 Managed Risk 2.0 Index

• Efficient protection with put option replication

SPRO

Cboe S&P 500 Buffer Protect Index Series

- Buy / sell options to incorporate nonlinear payoff structure
- SPVQDTR

S&P 500 Dynamic VEQTOR Index

• Forward-looking measures

Remove volatility constraint

- Combine best strategy elements from our study
- Reshape risk distribution using risk management overlay





Illustrative Risk Management Overlay Strategy (RMO)







Illustrative Risk Management Overlay Strategy (RMO)

- Provides efficient protection
- Significant reduction in drag









Illustrative Risk Management Overlay Strategy (RMO)

- Provides efficient protection
- Significant reduction in drag
- Significantly limits downside exposure













