

Session 49: Best Practices in Managing Variable Annuity (VA) Financial Risk

SOA Antitrust Disclaimer SOA Presentation Disclaimer



Session 49: Best Practices in Managing Variable Annuity (VA) Financial Risk

Sara Carstensen

May 21, 2019





SOCIETY OF ACTUARIES Antitrust Compliance Guidelines

Active participation in the Society of Actuaries is an important aspect of membership. While the positive contributions of professional societies and associations are well-recognized and encouraged, association activities are vulnerable to close antitrust scrutiny. By their very nature, associations bring together industry competitors and other market participants.

The United States antitrust laws aim to protect consumers by preserving the free economy and prohibiting anti-competitive business practices; they promote competition. There are both state and federal antitrust laws, although state antitrust laws closely follow federal law. The Sherman Act, is the primary U.S. antitrust law pertaining to association activities. The Sherman Act prohibits every contract, combination or conspiracy that places an unreasonable restraint on trade. There are, however, some activities that are illegal under all circumstances, such as price fixing, market allocation and collusive bidding.

There is no safe harbor under the antitrust law for professional association activities. Therefore, association meeting participants should refrain from discussing any activity that could potentially be construed as having an anti-competitive effect. Discussions relating to product or service pricing, market allocations, membership restrictions, product standardization or other conditions on trade could arguably be perceived as a restraint on trade and may expose the SOA and its members to antitrust enforcement procedures.

While participating in all SOA in person meetings, webinars, teleconferences or side discussions, you should avoid discussing competitively sensitive information with competitors and follow these guidelines:

- Do not discuss prices for services or products or anything else that might affect prices
- **Do not** discuss what you or other entities plan to do in a particular geographic or product markets or with particular customers.
- **Do not** speak on behalf of the SOA or any of its committees unless specifically authorized to do so.
- Do leave a meeting where any anticompetitive pricing or market allocation discussion occurs.
- Do alert SOA staff and/or legal counsel to any concerning discussions
- **Do** consult with legal counsel before raising any matter or making a statement that may involve competitively sensitive information.

Adherence to these guidelines involves not only avoidance of antitrust violations, but avoidance of behavior which might be so construed. These guidelines only provide an overview of prohibited activities. SOA legal counsel reviews meeting agenda and materials as deemed appropriate and any discussion that departs from the formal agenda should be scrutinized carefully. Antitrust compliance is everyone's responsibility; however, please seek legal counsel if you have any questions or concerns.



Presentation Disclaimer

Presentations are intended for educational purposes only and do not replace independent professional judgment. Statements of fact and opinions expressed are those of the participants individually and, unless expressly stated to the contrary, are not the opinion or position of the Society of Actuaries, its cosponsors or its committees. The Society of Actuaries does not endorse or approve, and assumes no responsibility for, the content, accuracy or completeness of the information presented. Attendees should note that the sessions are audio-recorded and may be published in various media, including print, audio and video formats without further notice.



GMxBs – Complex Options

• Variety of variable annuity riders which offer some form of investment guarantee on the VA account value

VA Guarantee	Form of Benefit	Guarantee – regardless of account performance
GMDB	Death Benefit	Upon death, return of premium, or some enhanced amount
GMIB	Lifetime Income	Minimum lifetime income stream
Lifetime GMWB	Lifetime Income	Minimum lifetime income stream
GMWB	Withdrawal Benefit	Return of purchase payments via withdrawals
GMAB	Accumulation benefit	Sets a floor on account value, typically initial purchase payments



VA Guarantees vs. Options

• Investment guarantees in VA's create embedded optionality

	Feature	Equity Put	GMIB
1.	Pays when index below strike	Yes	Yes
2.	Strike Form	Lump Sum	Life Annuity
3.	Ratchets, Stepups	No	Yes
4.	Policyholder behavior: lapse, withdrawals, exercise	No	Yes
5.	Path dependency	No	Yes
6.	Basis Risk	No	Yes

- VA guarantees are much more complex than vanilla capital market derivatives
- Require stochastic simulations for valuation



Hedging – Considerations

- What's being hedged ?
- Dynamic vs. static hedging
- Active vs. passive hedging



Can cover multiple option "underlyings"

	Equity		Interest Rates		Volatility/Other		Behavior
•	Market index levels	٠	Parallel yield changes	۰	Volatility drives option value	•	"Base" dynamic behavior
•	Single stocks	•	"Key rate" yield changes	۰	Volatility term structure	٠	Alternative policyholder
							behavior

 Target volatility funds vary equity exposure

SOCIETY OF

Credit spreads

 Generally higher at longer tenors

Insurers also need to consider multiple balance sheets

Statutory

- Change in stat reserve
 - AG43 standard
 - CTE(70)
 - Voluntary reserves
- Change in Stat capital / TAR
- Discontinuities impact liability "greeks"

GAAP

- FAS 133/157 for non-life contingent benefits
 - Risk neutral option value
 - Using h-ratio
 - Own credit and risk margins for FAS 157
- SOP03-1 applies to life contingent benefits

Economic

- Risk neutral valuation
 - PV claims minus PV fees
 - A range of discount rates possible



Stat, GAAP, Economic - Conflicting Objectives

- Stat, GAAP and economic risk profiles differ
- SOP 03-1 and Stat generally less sensitive than economic
- Not possible to simultaneously hedge all three balance sheets





Can use multiple hedge programs

- "Core" program to stabilize income and balance sheet for modest market moves
 - Fully economic hedged usually means overhedged on Stat and GAAP
 - Stat or GAAP hedging generally underhedges economic risk

- Can overlay "macro" program to cover more extreme scenarios
 - Out of money options to cover extreme market moves
 - May need to define "deductible loss"
 - e.g., maintain 250% RBC in a 2008 crisis scenario



Dynamic vs. Static Hedging

Dynamic

- Continuous rebalancing
- Used to hedge smaller market moves
- Linear instruments
- Replicates an option
- Pay realized volatility
- Cost very sensitive to volatility movements

- Fixed positions
- Can hedge different degrees of option "moneyness"

Static

- Option like instruments
- Buys the option outright
- Pay market implied volatility
- Volatility cost more locked in



Upcoming Changes to Valuation Frameworks

Statutory

Effective 1/1/2020

- Aligned calculations and scenarios for CTE 90/70
- Redefined standard scenario
- Changes to accounting for interest rate derivatives (SSAP NO.108) will reduce asset/liability mismatch
- Likely to better align stat and economic liability calculations

GAAP

Effective 1/1/2021

The frameworks are converging towards economic, but differences will remain.

- Market risk benefits cover all liabilities with material capital market exposure
- VA SOP 03-1 benefits moving from accrual to fair value treatment
- Will increase GAAP net income sensitivity to market movements

Economic

No Changes

SOCIETY OF ACTUARIES

Better alignment of Stat, GAAP, Economic metrics

• GAAP net income much more closely aligned with and economic risk in new framework







Better alignment of Stat, GAAP, Economic metrics

• GAAP net income much more closely aligned with and economic risk in new framework





Potential impacts

- Greater analyst focus on net income
- Greater focus on economic values
- Higher hedge targets in "core" hedge programs
- Greater demand for volatility instruments







Best Practices in Managing VA Financial Risk

A Software Vendor's Perspective

Sean Hayward May 3, 2019 Empowering the Financial World





Fis



ËS



















This is just one statutory valuation!

















Leverage Cloud Advanced Compute Results Storage Automation





Cloud = More compute cores, right?

🕈 Home		(3)		501	and the second se	2	- 22-	3	
Dashboard	Virtual machines	App Services	Storage accounts	SQL databases	Azure Database for	Azure Cosmos DB	Kubernetes	Function App	
All services					PostgreSQL servers		services		
INVORITES	-				NR SE		0.12		
All resources	Microsoft L		Azure Mo	our apps and	Security C	ur apps and		nagement and optimize your	
Resource groups	online train Microsoft		infrastruct		infrastructure		cloud spend for free		
App Services	MICrosoft								
Function Apps									
SQL databases	Recent resource	see all your rec	ent resources 🤌 See	all your resources >			Useful links		
Azure Cosmos DB							Technical Docum		
Virtual machines			1				Azure Services (Recent Azure U		
Load balancers			(- 4	<-)			Azure Blog [2]	August 12	
Storage accounts			1	1					
• Virtual networks							Azure mob	ile app	
Azure Active Directory	No recent resources to display						App Sto	re Soog	
Monitor		As you visit	resources, they'll be list quick and er		resources for				
Advisor			Create a r	esource					
Security Center									
Cost Management + Billing									
B Help + support									

,O Search by	VM size	X Clear all filters						
Generation : 2 selected		Premium disk : 54	pported Ø	* Add filter				
Showing 96 o	f 211 VM sizes.	I Subscription: Vis	ual Studio Pr	ofessional (Region: East US	6 Current s	ize: Standard_D2s_v3	
VM SIZE	OFFERING	FAMILY	VCPUS	RAM (GB)	DATA DISKS	MAX IOPS	TEMPORARY STOR	PREMIUM DISK SUP
Bils	Standard	General purpose	1	0.5	2	200	4 GB	Ves
B1ms	Standard	General purpose	1	2	2	800	4 GB	Ves
B1s	Standard	General purpose	1	1	2	400	4 GB	Yes
B2ms	Standard	General purpose	2	8	4	2400	16 GB	Yes
825	Standard	General purpose	2	4	4	1600	8 GB	Ves
84ms	Standard	General purpose	4	16	8	3600	32 GB	Ves
BBms	Standard	General purpose	8	32	16	4320	64 GB	Ves
D165_v3	Standard	General purpose	16	64	32	25600	128 GB	Ves
D2s_v3	Standard	General purpose	2	8	4	3200	16 GB	Ves
D45_v3	Standard	General purpose	4	16	8	6400	32 GB	Yes
D8s_v3	Standard	General purpose	8	32	16	12800	64 GB	Yes
D51_v2	Standard	General purpose	1	3.5	4	3200	7 GB	Yes
D\$11_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	2	14	8	6400	28 GB	Yes
D\$11+1_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	1	14	8	6400	28 GB	Yes
DS12_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	4	28	16	12800	56 GB	Ves
DS12-1_V2	Standard	Memory optimized	1	28	16	12800	56 GB	Ves
D\$12-2_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	2	28	16	12800	56 GB	Ves
D513_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	8	56	32	25600	112 GB	Ves
D513-2_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	2	56	32	25600	112 GB	Ves
D513-4_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	4	56	32	25600	112 GB	Yes
D\$14_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	16	112	64	51200	224 GB	Ves
DS14+4_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	4	112	64	51200	224 GB	Yes
D514-8_v2	Standard	Memory optimized	8	112	64	51200	224 GB	Ves
D52_v2	Standard	General purpose	2	7	a	6400	14 GB	Yès
D\$3_v2	Standard	General purpose	40	14	16	12800	28 GB	Yes
D\$4_v2	Standard	General purpose	8	28	32	25600	56 GB	Yes
D\$5_v2	Standard	General purpose	16	56	64	51200	112 GB	Yes





Not "one size fits all", even within a single modelling exercise!

Need to understand the problems being solved, choose hardware accordingly

Considerations:

- RAM requirements
- I/O needs
- Reporting granularity
- Computational intensity









Leverage Cloud Advanced Compute Results Storage Automation





Advanced Compute

GPUs have come a long way!



- In the early days GPU accuracy wasn't good enough for intensive compute resources like actuarial modelling
- GPU cards are efficient in performing floating point calculations
- The calculations need to be highly independent and have low memory requirements
- There are two options for GPU compute:
- Dedicated GPU cards installed in server boxes or utilising specific "GPU Compute" cores in the public cloud
- Latest cards like Nvidia's Quadro GV100 are extremely powerful

GPUs are the answer to everything! (Maybe not.....)

- Extremely specialized, both in configuration and problems it is able to address
- Limited RAM availability
- Results need to be passed back to CPU, which is typically slow



Advanced Compute

....so have CPUs



- Intel's AVX behaves similarly to GPU, but with less constraints and scalability
- AVX (Advanced Vector Extensions) is an evolution of SIMD (Single instruction, multiple data) which could operate on a vector of data with a single instruction
- AVX-512 is included in the latest chipsets from Intel
- Utilising AVX more effectively will make best use of the available hardware and more cost effective deployment

Or did GPUs just cause CPU makers to wake up.....

- Enhanced vectorization capabilities provide some of the upside of GPUs with a fraction of the development cost
- Still requires some code updates, though likely changes that should have been made anyway
- Still may not be fast enough for some very specialized problems









Leverage Cloud Advanced Compute Results Storage Automation





Standard File Server

File I/O is handled by the Windows file system.

Core	Core	Core
1	2	1,000
\mathbb{H}		-



Depending on the model, I/O can be more time consuming than calculations

Adding cores shares the compute load, but shifts the bottleneck to the file system

Distributing homogenous calculations evenly means many cores completing at same time

Simultaneous updates of data unique to actuarial models?

Facebook / Google?

Distributed database technology created to address this (and other) problem




Results Storage

Standard File Server

File I/O is handled by the Windows file system.

Core	Core	Core
1	2	1,000
\mathbb{H}		

Distributed Databases

Compressed results are written to a network of database servers managed by a dedicated database manager. The architecture is designed to support parallel reads and writes.







Results Storage

Many different options available, each with different pros & cons

- Hadoop
- MongoDB
- ArangoDB

Most are open source, with varying levels of support for Windows & Linux

Can be interdependence with cloud provider, should be part of broader design decision

Software vendors should all be moving in this direction

Distributed Databases

Compressed results are written to a network of database servers managed by a dedicated database manager. The architecture is designed to support parallel reads and writes.













Leverage Cloud Advanced Compute Results Storage Automation







Nothing slower than a stalled task waiting for a person





Automation isn't a new topic, but tools have come a long way













Approvals

Branching

Proactive Notifications Audit Trails





Latest Buzzword: Robotics

Many Companies now have actual robots working for them!





Robotics Process Automation (RPA)

The application of technology that allows employees in a company to configure computer software or a "robot" to capture and interpret existing applications for processing a transaction, manipulating data, triggering responses and communicating with other digital systems.

Old "Automation" — Humans write rules, computer executes rules

New "RPA"



Humans perform tasks, computer learns, computer performs tasks

Can't manage what you can't model

Technology is your friend

The robots are coming



Empowering the Financial World

©2018 FIS and/or its subsidiaries. All Rights Reserved. FIS confidential and proprietary information.



Best Practices in Variable Annuity Financial Risk Management May 21, 2019

www.conning.com | © 2018 Conning, Inc.



BRIEF REVIEW OF VA AND UPCOMING REGULATORY CHANGES

VA Guarantees: Path Dependent, Complex Options

VA Guarantee	Form of Benefit	Guarantee Details	
Guaranteed Minimum Death Benefit (GMDB)	Lump Sum Payment	If death occurs during the accumulation phase, provides the greater of: account value, premium, and in some cases an enhanced benefit	
Guaranteed Minimum Accumulation Benefit (GMAB)	Floor on account value after a specific period of time Floor is typically set to premium contributions withdrawals		
Guaranteed Minimum Income Benefit (GMIB)	Lifetime income stream	Upon annuitization, provides a minimum benefit base that can be enhanced by step-ups, roll-ups or ratchets	
Guaranteed Minimum Withdrawal Benefit (GMWB)	Income stream over a certain period of time or the policyholder's lifetime	Guarantees a minimum percentage of the benefit base can be withdrawn annually. Benefit base is often enhanced with step-ups, resets, etc.	



Key Risks and Modeling Components



- Utilization rates associated with guarantees
 - GMWB, GMIB, etc.

- With "Insurance" risks
- With other product lines

0

0

Computational Considerations

Technological advancements (GPUs and cloud computing) allow for a more robust quantification of the risk associated with Variable Annuity riders

 A 30-year monthly projection comprised of 1,000 real world outer-loop scenarios with 1,000 risk neutral inner-loops at each timestep would require 360 million projections





Highlights of Potential Impacts from Regulatory Changes

- Three balance sheets converging towards an Economic based ALM
- GAAP and Stat will be more sensitive to market movements
- Benefits of hedging can be more easily reflected, and this will increase hedge targets
- Increased transparency and standardization, ultimately reducing the need for adjustments





SAMPLE VA ERM PROCESS: ECONOMIC CAPITAL



VA ERM Process: Economic Capital





Real World Outer Loop Scenarios: Rising Yields

Real World Outer Loop scenarios are retrospective, and generally calibrated to historical data; however, actuarial judgement should be used to reflect the company's views of the future state of economic and financial market variables

I-to-H vs. I-to-N Calibration: Treasury Yields





VA ERM

Process

Real World Outer Loop Scenarios: Returns

VA ERM Process

Real World

Scenarios

ALM

- Calibrating purely to historical rates results in negative returns for longer duration * treasury asset classes, particularly in the early years of the projection
- ** Economic capital market assumptions should be both consistent with historical observations, and also reflect a forward-looking view of market expectations and uncertainties

Treasury 1 Year I-to-N vs. I-to-H Calibration

	Initial-to-Normative		Initial-to-Historical	
	Asset Class	Average Annual Return	Asset Class	Average Annual Return
Risk Neutral	US Cash	1.62%	US Cash	1.37%
Scenarios	US Treas 1 to 3	2.16%	US Treas 1 to 3	1.87%
	US Treas 3 to 5	2.30%	US Treas 3 to 5	1.30%
\mathbf{X}	US Treas 5 to 7	2.14%	US Treas 5 to 7	0.73%
	US Treas 7 to 10	1.64%	US Treas 7 to 10	0.12%
LM and Capital	US Treas 10 to 20	0.58%	US Treas 10 to 20	-0.61%
	US Treas 20 plus	-1.57%	US Treas 20 plus	-1.89%



Hedging **Benefit**



Real World Outer Loop Scenarios: Calibration





Real World Outer Loop Scenarios: Regulatory Changes





Real Neutral Inner Loop Scenarios





ALM and Capital: VM-21



Current State of AG-43 under VM-21: CTE Amount

- CTE amount is derived from the analysis of asset and liability cash flows produced by the application of a stochastic model of interest rates and equity returns
- For each scenario, greatest present value of accumulated deficiencies at the end of each
- Accumulated deficiency is the difference in assets and liabilities at the end of the year in each scenario where the liability is equal to the "working reserve"
- Reserve is set at the CTE 70 level: the average of the worst 30% of deficiencies

STATUTORY CHANGE Removal of Working Reserve from GPVAD calculation

RESULT: Better alignment with Economic view

Statutory View Assuming Hedging:

 $CTE Amount = HE x CTE Amount_{with hedging} + (1 - HE) x CTE Amount_{without hedging}$



ALM and Capital: Economic





Modeling Considerations



Additional breakage must be considered that is not captured in the model:

- Fund Basis/ Fund Mapping Risk
- Liquidity
- Inconsistency between projection intervals and rebalancing frequency

Additional Key Assumptions:

- Longevity/Mortality
- Policyholder behavior:
 - Rider utilization efficiency
 - Dynamic Lapses
 - Shock Lapses
 - Policyholder behavior becomes increasing unpredictable in an economic shock



Modeling Considerations: Correlation

✤ Correlation and quantifying diversification are vital across all phases of the model

* Tail correlation among assets and risk factors





VA ERM

Process

Real World Scenarios

Risk Neutral Scenarios

ALM and Capital

Modeling Considerations

> Hedging Benefit

Modeling Considerations: Vol Target Funds



Vol Target and Vol Transfer Funds:

- Many large VA writers have introduced managed volatility funds
 - When volatility rises funds are transferred out of equities and into cash or fixed income
 - Designed to limit equity exposure when market volatility increases

Rebalancing Algorithms introduce added complexity to the valuation of VAs

- · Increased complexity in modeling fund returns
- · How effective are these funds at delivering stable volatility?
- · How does this impact the cost of the guarantees from Insurer's perspective?
- Cost of guarantees is extremely sensitive to choice of equity model and volatility convention
- Tail equity scenarios result in reduced liability delta but increased exposure to rates and credit



Modeling Considerations: Vol Target Funds





Hedging Decisions



- What to Hedge?
 - KRDs, credit spreads, equity index levels
- Sensitivity tests should be performed to decide on the specific liability components to hedge, and to analyze the costs and benefits of candidate hedging strategies:
 - Fully hedge claims, Stop-loss (deductible), or first loss hedging
 - Do you hedge fees?
- Do you supplement "core" hedge programs with macro hedges that would provide added protection in tail economic scenarios?

GAAP CHANGE: Valuation of all guarantees moving to fair value



Hedging Decisions: Benefits and Costs





Disclosures

Conning, Inc., Goodwin Capital Advisers, Inc., Conning Investment Products, Inc., a FINRA-registered broker dealer, Conning Asset Management Limited, Conning Asia Pacific Limited and Octagon Credit Investors, LLC are all direct or indirect subsidiaries of Conning Holdings Limited (collectively, "Conning") which is one of the family of companies owned by Cathay Financial Holding Co., Ltd., a Taiwan-based company. Conning has offices in Boston, Cologne, Hartford, Hong Kong, London, New York, and Tokyo. Global Evolution Fondsmæglerselskab A/S and its group of companies ("Global Evolution") are affiliates of Conning with their head office located in Kolding, Denmark.

Conning, Inc., Conning Investment Products, Inc., Goodwin Capital Advisers, Inc., Octagon Credit Investors, LLC, and Global Evolution USA, LLC are registered with the Securities and Exchange Commission ("SEC") under the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 and have noticed other jurisdictions they are conducting securities advisory business when required by law. In any other jurisdictions where they have not provided notice and are not exempt or excluded from those laws, they cannot transact business as an investment adviser and may not be able to respond to individual inquiries if the response could potentially lead to a transaction in securities.

Conning, Inc. is also registered with the National Futures Association and Korea's Financial Services Commission. Conning Investment Products, Inc. is also registered with the Ontario Securities Commission. Conning Asset Management Limited is Authorised and regulated by the United Kingdom's Financial Conduct Authority (FCA#189316), Conning Asia Pacific Limited is regulated by Hong Kong's Securities and Futures Commission for Types 1, 4 and 9 regulated activities, and Global Evolution Fondsmæglerselskab A / S (FSA #8193) is regulated by Finanstilsynet (the Danish FSA). Conning and Global Evolution primarily provide asset management services for third-party assets.

Conning and Global Evolution predominantly invest client portfolios in fixed income strategies in accordance with guidelines supplied by its institutional clients.

All investment performance information included within this material is historical. Past performance is not a guarantee of future results. Any tax related information contained within this presentation is for informational purposes only and should not be considered tax advice. You should consult a tax professional with any questions.

For complete details regarding Conning and its services, you should refer to our Form ADV Part 2 (for all US entities), which may be obtained by calling us.

Legal Disclaimer

©2019 Conning, Inc. This document and the software described within are copyrighted with all rights reserved. No part of this document may be distributed, reproduced, transcribed, transmitted, stored in an electronic retrieval system, or translated into any language in any form by any means without the prior written permission of Conning and Global Evolution, as applicable. Neither Conning nor Global Evolution make any warranties, express or implied, in this document. In no event shall Conning or Global Evolution, as applicable be liable for damages of any kind arising out of the use of this document or the information contained within it. This document is not intended to be complete, and we do not guarantee its accuracy. Any opinion expressed herein is subject to change at any time without notice.

This document contains information that is confidential or proprietary to Conning (or their direct and indirect subsidiaries or Global Evolution, as applicable). By accepting this document you agree that: (1) if there is any pre-existing contract containing disclosure and use restrictions between your company and Conning or Global Evolution, as applicable, you and your company will use this information in reliance on and subject to the terms of any such pre-existing contract; or (2) if there is no contractual relationship between you and your company and Conning or Global Evolution, as applicable, you and your company and Conning or Global Evolution, as applicable, you and your company agree to protect this information and not to reproduce, disclose or use the information in any way, except as may be required by law.

ADVISE[®], FIRM[®], and GEMS[®] are registered trademarks of Conning, Inc. Copyright 1990-2019 Conning, Inc. All rights reserved. ADVISE[®], FIRM[®], and GEMS[®] are proprietary software published and owned by Conning, Inc.

This material is for informational purposes only and should not be interpreted as an offer to sell, or a solicitation or recommendation of an offer to buy any security, product or service, or retain Conning or Global Evolution for investment advisory services. This information is not intended to be nor should it be used as investment advice.

