Equity-Based Insurance Guarantees Conference Nov. 6-7, 2017 Baltimore, MD

## Variable Annuity Volatility Management:

### An Era of Risk Control

Berlinda Liu

Sponsored by





# Variable Annuity Volatility Management: An era of risk control

EBIG Conference 7 November 2017 (1030 – 1200 hours) Copyright © 2017 by S&P Global. All rights reserved.



S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

# Agenda

- Recent trends in market volatility
- Analytical results of existing solutions
- Next generation of volatility management solutions

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### **Recent Trends in Market Volatility**

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

## **A New Era of Market Volatility**

#### Realized Volatility of S&P 500 (1951 – 1H2017)



Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### Gamma Volatility Loss of 60/40 Funds



Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### **Decreased Appetite for Equity Risk**



Change in Maximum Equity Allowance of Guaranteed Income Products

Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

# **Innovative Volatility Management Solutions**

		Performance objective of fund	Peers using solution
Asset transfer program		Re-allocate client discretionary funds to bond funds based on in-the- moneyness of the contract; transfers occur at a defined ratio of account value to benefit base (AV / BB)	Prudential Financial AXA Equitable
Volatility targeting	Capped volatility	Cap the expected volatility of fund returns at a defined level, e.g., realized volatility not to exceed 30%	AXA Equitable
	Target volatility	Target a specific and constant level of volatility of fund returns, e.g., targeting 15% volatility	Most VA manufacturers
	Capital preservation	Fund risk position declines if prior performance is poor, or positions are used to 'hedge" changes in the cost of the company's guarantees	Milliman funds
		Target rider charge based on provailing level of VIX	AIG
Market-linked	VIX-indexed fees	Subject to (i) ceiling, and (ii) floor	Lincoln Financial (previously)
	UST-indexed	Target rider charge or other features (e.g., roll-up and/or payout rates) based on prevailing level of 10-year US treasury	Pacific Life

Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

# **Illustration of Risk Control Solutions**

Asset-transfer program (ATP)

Volatility management / risk-control funds



Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

## **Illustration of Market Linked Fee Solutions**



Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

# **Challenges of Existing Solutions**

- Performance Benchmarking
- Loss of "Upside Potential"
- Clarity of Investment Thesis



A Division of S&P Global

### **Analytical Results of Existing Solutions**

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

# **Analytical Framework of Evaluation**

- Insurer Perspective
  - Write profitable business
  - Stabilize asset-liability management and hedging performance
    - Hedge ratio
    - Hedge-ability
    - Basis risk
  - Optimize capital requirements
- Client and Advisor Perspective
  - Maintain upside potential
    - Return and volatility characteristics
    - Long-term equity allocation
    - Cumulative fees paid (VIX-indexed fee)
  - Minimize impact to guarantee value

### **Insurer Perspective: Impact on Guarantee Cost**

**Reduction in Volatility Cost of the Guarantee** 



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Insurer Perspective: Impact on Hedge Ratio**



**Risk-control strategy** 

Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices 1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/ A Division of S&P Global For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Insurer Perspective: Impact on Basis Risk**

#### Weekly Change in Equity Allocation (1970 – 1H2017)



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Insurer Perspective: Impact on Hedge-Ability**



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Insurer Perspective: Scorecard**

Objective	Metric	Measure	Static 60/40	ATP	Capped volatility	Target volatility	Capital preservation	VIX-indexed fees
Write profitable business	Guarantee cost	Reduction in "volatility cost" of guarantee	N/A	62%	15%	61%	94%	26%
	Hedge ratio	Vega – impact of a 1% reduction in volatility (% premium)	0.53%	0.25%	0.40%	0.12%	0.03%	0.36%
Stabilize ALM and hedging performance	Hedge- ability	Stability of hedge P&L (2008 hedge gain/loss)	-4.2%	-1.3%	-1.5%	~0.0%	+0.6%	-3.0%
	"Basis risk"	% of weeks that have a non-zero equity allocation change	N/A	N/A	4%	48%	99%	N/A

Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Client Perspective: Impact on Return & Volatility**



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Client Perspective: Impact on Long Term Equity Ratio**

Historical Equity Allocation (1970 - 1H2017)



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Client Perspective: Impact on Cumulative Fees Paid**



Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices 1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/ A Division of S&P Global For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY. Permission to reprint or distribute any content from this presentation requires the written approval of S&P Dow Jones Indices.

20

### **Client Perspective: Impact on Guaranteed Income Levels**

#### Guaranteed Income in the First Year of Retirement After 10 Years of Investment Accumulation (\$100K Initial Investment)



Assumptions:

- Guaranteed return of 6%
- Withdrawal rate of 5%
- Annual MER of 1.3%
- Investment management fee of 1.0%
- Rider fee of 1%

Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### **Client Perspective: Scorecards**

Objective	Metric	Measure	Static 60/40	Asset-Transfer Program	Capped volatility	Target Volatility	Capital preservation	VIX-indexed Fees
Maintain	Return and volatility characteristics	• 2000-2009						
investment		<ul> <li>Returns</li> </ul>	-0.37%	N/A	-0.25%	-0.55%	-0.06%	-0.73%
upside potential		<ul> <li>Volatility</li> </ul>	12.92%	N/A	11.05%	8.19%	5.26%	12.92%
potonia		• 2010-2017:						
		<ul> <li>Returns</li> </ul>	6.19%	N/A	6.05%	5.40%	2.82%	6.20%
		<ul> <li>Volatility</li> </ul>	8.65%	N/A	8.52%	7.60%	4.55%	8.65%
	Long-term equity	<ul> <li>Average allocation to real investments</li> </ul>						
	allocation	- 2000-2017	60%	N/A	59%	55%	33%	60%
		- 1970-2017	60%	N/A	59%	58%	45%	60%
	Cumulative fees paid	<ul> <li>(Historical) Average fees (1970-2017)</li> </ul>	100	100	100	100	100	101
		<ul> <li>(Prospective) Fees paid</li> </ul>						
		– Average	100	100	100	100	100	109
		– 75 <sup>th</sup> %-ile	100	100	100	100	100	114
		- 25 <sup>th</sup> %-ile	100	100	100	100	100	105
Minimize impact to	Guaranteed income levels	<ul> <li>(Prospective) Initial withdrawal rate of</li> </ul>						
guarantee		- 5%	8.8%	8.7%	8.8%	8.4%	8.1%	8.8%
value		- 5.5%	N/A	9.6%	9.6%	9.2%	8.9%	9.6%

Source: Oliver Wyman. All information presented is back-tested. Charts and tables are provided for illustrative purposes. Back-tested performance is hypothetical performance created with hindsight. Actual returns may differ from, and be lower than, back-tested returns. Index performance does not reflect fees or expenses. Please see the Performance Disclosure at the end of this presentation for more information on the inherent limitations associated with back-tested performance.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

1 Managers Average is the arithmetic mean of four risk-parity managers, net of fees. Managers Average fees are not disclosed. Sources: https://www.barclayhedge.com/ and https://finance.yahoo.com/

For Financial Professionals. Not for Public Distribution. PROPRIETARY.

### Next Generation of Volatility Management Solutions

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### Liability Convexity & Effectiveness of VIX-Indexed Fee Risk Solutions



#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### Liability Convexity & Effectiveness of VIX-Indexed Fee Risk Solutions



#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### VIX-Indexed Fee + Capped Volatility Solution: Hedge-Ability

Simulated Performance During 2008/2009 Financial Crisis



Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### VIX-Indexed Fee + Capped Volatility Solution: Impact on Select Metrics

	Measure			Joint risk solution	Capped volatility	VIX-indexed fee	Static 60/40 fund
rer metrics	Reduction in "volatility cost" of guarantee			40%	15%	26%	N/A
	Vega – impact of a 1% reduction in volatility (% premium)			0.24%	0.40%	0.36%	0.53%
Insu	Stability of hedge P&L (2008 hedge gain/loss)			-0.24%	-1.47%	-2.99%	-4.22%
onsumer metrics	Returns and volatility characteristics	2000 – 2009 2000 – 2009 eristics 2010 – 2017	Returns	-0.61%	-0.25%	-0.73%	-0.37%
			Volatility	11.05%	11.05%	12.92%	12.92%
			Returns	6.06%	6.05%	6.20%	6.19%
			Volatility	8.51%	8.52%	8.65%	8.65%
	(Historical) Fees paid - average			101 bps	100 bps	101 bps	100 bps
	(Prospective) Fees paid – average			109 bps	100 bps	109 bps	100 bps
Ŭ							
	(Prospective) Initial withdrawal rate at 5%			8.7%	8.8%	8.8%	8.8%

Source: Oliver Wyman.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

## Conclusions

- Risk control features provide material risk management benefits to varied extents.
- Market environment affects the effectiveness of risk solutions.
- Different risk control solutions have experienced challenges due to lack of performance transparency in different degrees.
- Potential next generation solution combines VIX-indexed fee and capped volatility to balance the risk management benefit against client and advisor perception.

### Appendix

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### **Parameters of Back Test**

Volatility management	Parameter specification					
Asset transfer	<ul> <li>Define Guarantee Ratio = 1 - account value to benefit base (AV/BB)</li> <li>Define a minimum threshold point as Threshold = minimum(50%, 10% + 2% x policy duration)</li> </ul>					
program	• Fixed income allocation is driven by extent to which the ratio exceeds the threshold point within a 10% band, e.g., given a ratio of 30% and a threshold of 20%, the allocation to fixed income would be 100%					
Capped volatility	<ul><li>Realized volatility not to exceed 30%</li><li>Equity allocation to not exceed target of 60%</li></ul>					
Target volatility	<ul><li>Realized volatility of 15% targeted</li><li>Fund can at most allocate 66% to equities through the use of leverage</li></ul>					
Capital preservation	<ul> <li>Assumes a similar implied equity allocation as the target volatility</li> <li>Implied equity allocation is adjusted down based on the delta of a 5-year rolling put option</li> </ul>					
VIX-indexed fees	<ul> <li>After an initial lock-in year at a base fee, the rider fee calculated each quarter as 100 bps + 10 bps x (VIX - 20)</li> <li>Rider fee is subject to an overall floor of 75 bps and a ceiling of 250 bps</li> <li>Value of the VIX input is based on spot VIX for simplicity of modeling</li> </ul>					

Source: Oliver Wyman

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

## About S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC

S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC ("S&P DJI") is among the world's largest index providers with customers in 71 countries, 21 locations and over 500 client dedicated professionals. Home to iconic financial market indicators, such as the S&P 500<sup>®</sup> and the Dow Jones Industrial Average<sup>™</sup>, S&P DJI has over 115 years of experience constructing innovative and transparent solutions that fulfill the needs of investors, and has been a catalyst for some of the most important financial innovations. The S&P 500 is among the world's most followed stock market index with USD 7.5 trillion in benchmarked assets and USD 2.1 trillion directly indexed to it. With over one million indices calculated across all asset classes, S&P DJI defines the way that investors measure and trade the markets. For more information, please visit our website at <u>www.spindices.com</u>

S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### **General Disclaimer**

Copyright © 2017 by S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC, a part of S&P Global. All rights reserved. Standard & Poor's ®, S&P 500 ® and S&P ® are registered trademarks of Standard & Poor's Financial Services LLC ("S&P"), a subsidiary of S&P Global. Dow Jones ® is a registered trademark of Dow Jones Trademark Holdings LLC ("Dow Jones"). Trademarks have been licensed to S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC. Redistribution, reproduction and/or photocopying in whole or in part are prohibited without written permission. This document does not constitute an offer of services in jurisdictions where S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC, Dow Jones, S&P or their respective affiliates (collectively "S&P Dow Jones Indices") do not have the necessary licenses. All information provided by S&P Dow Jones Indices to third parties. Past performance of an index is not a guarantee of future results.

It is not possible to invest directly in an index. Exposure to an asset class represented by an index is available through investable instruments based on that index. S&P Dow Jones Indices does not sponsor, endorse, sell, promote or manage any investment fund or other investment vehicle that is offered by third parties and that seeks to provide an investment return based on the performance of any index. S&P Dow Jones Indices makes no assurance that investment products based on the index will accurately track index performance or provide positive investment returns. S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC is not an investment advisor, and S&P Dow Jones Indices makes no representation regarding the advisability of investing in any such investment fund or other investment vehicle. A decision to invest in any such investment fund or other vehicle should not be made in reliance on any of the statements set forth in this document. Prospective investors are advised to make an investment in any such fund or other vehicle only after carefully considering the risks associated with investing in such funds, as detailed in an offering memorandum or similar document that is prepared by or on behalf of the issuer of the investment fund or other vehicle. Inclusion of a security within an index is not a recommendation by S&P Dow Jones Indices to buy, sell, or hold such security, nor is it considered to be investment advice.

These materials have been prepared solely for informational purposes based upon information generally available to the public and from sources believed to be reliable. No content contained in these materials (including index data, ratings, credit-related analyses and data, research, valuations, model, software or other application or output therefrom) or any part thereof (Content) may be modified, reverse-engineered, reproduced or distributed in any form or by any means, or stored in a database or retrieval system, without the prior written permission of S&P Dow Jones Indices. The Content shall not be used for any unlawful or unauthorized purposes. S&P Dow Jones Indices and its third-party data providers and licensors (collectively "S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties") do not guarantee the accuracy, completeness, timeliness or availability of the Content. S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties of the cause, for the results obtained from the use of the Content. THE CONTENT IS PROVIDED ON AN "AS IS" BASIS. S&P DOW JONES INDICES PARTIES DISCLAIM ANY AND ALL EXPRESS OR IMPLIED WARRANTIES, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, ANY WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE OR USE, FREEDOM FROM BUGS, SOFTWARE ERRORS OR DEFECTS, THAT THE CONTENT'S FUNCTIONING WILL BE UNINTERRUPTED OR THAT THE CONTENT WILL OPERATE WITH ANY SOFTWARE OR HARDWARE CONFIGURATION. In no event shall S&P Dow Jones Indices Parties be liable to any party for any direct, incidental, exemplary, compensatory, punitive, special or consequential damages, costs, expenses, legal fees, or losses (including, without limitation, lost income or lost profits and opportunity costs) in connection with any use of the Content even if advised of the possibility of such damages.

S&P Dow Jones Indices keeps certain activities of its business units separate from each other in order to preserve the independence and objectivity of their respective activities. As a result, certain business units of S&P Dow Jones Indices may have information that is not available to other business units. S&P Dow Jones Indices has established policies and procedures to maintain the confidentiality of certain non-public information received in connection with each analytical process.

In addition, S&P Dow Jones Indices provides a wide range of services to, or relating to, many organizations, including issuers of securities, investment advisers, broker-dealers, investment banks, other financial institutions and financial intermediaries, and accordingly may receive fees or other economic benefits from those organizations, including organizations whose securities or services they may recommend, rate, include in model portfolios, evaluate or otherwise address.

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global

### **Performance Disclosure**

S&P Dow Jones Indices defines various dates to assist our clients in providing transparency. The First Value Date is the first day for which there is a calculated value (either live or backtested) for a given index. The Base Date is the date at which the Index is set at a fixed value for calculation purposes. The Launch Date designates the date upon which the values of an index are first considered live: index values provided for any date or time period prior to the index's Launch Date are considered back-tested. S&P Dow Jones Indices defines the Launch Date as the date by which the values of an index are known to have been released to the public, for example via the company's public website or its datafeed to external parties. For Dow Jones-branded indices introduced prior to May 31, 2013, the Launch Date (which prior to May 31, 2013, was termed "Date of introduction") is set at a date upon which no further changes were permitted to be made to the index methodology, but that may have been prior to the Index's public release date.

Past performance of the Index is not an indication of future results. Prospective application of the methodology used to construct the Index may not result in performance commensurate with the back-test returns shown. The back-test period does not necessarily correspond to the entire available history of the Index. Please refer to the methodology paper for the Index, available at <u>www.spdji.com</u> for more details about the index, including the manner in which it is rebalanced, the timing of such rebalancing, criteria for additions and deletions, as well as all index calculations.

Another limitation of using back-tested information is that the back-tested calculation is generally prepared with the benefit of hindsight. Back-tested information reflects the application of the index methodology and selection of index constituents in hindsight. No hypothetical record can completely account for the impact of financial risk in actual trading. For example, there are numerous factors related to the equities, fixed income, or commodities markets in general which cannot be, and have not been accounted for in the preparation of the index information set forth, all of which can affect actual performance.

The Index returns shown do not represent the results of actual trading of investable assets/securities. S&P Dow Jones Indices LLC maintains the Index and calculates the Index levels and performance shown or discussed, but does not manage actual assets. Index returns do not reflect payment of any sales charges or fees an investor may pay to purchase the securities underlying the Index or investment funds that are intended to track the performance of the Index. The imposition of these fees and charges would cause actual and back-tested performance of the securities/fund to be lower than the Index performance shown. As a simple example, if an index returned 10% on a US \$10,000 investment for a 12-month period (or US \$1,000) and an actual asset-based fee of 1.5% was imposed at the end of the period on the investment plus accrued interest (or US \$1,650), the net return would be 8.35% (or US \$8,350) for the year. Over a three year period, an annual 1.5% fee taken at year end with an assumed 10% return per year would result in a cumulative gross return of 33.10%, a total fee of US \$5,375, and a cumulative net return of 27.2% (or US \$27,200).

#### S&P Dow Jones Indices

A Division of S&P Global